# Table of contents

Acknowledgements xiv  
Abbreviations xvii  

1 Subject and methodology 3  
  1.1 Introduction 3  
  1.1.1 Subject matter of this study 3  
  1.1.2 Aims of this study 6  
  1.1.3 Why study the law about defects in things exchanged for money? 7  
  1.1.4 Current state of research 8  
  1.2 Methodology 10  
  1.2.1 Comparative legal history 10  
  1.2.2 Research topics 11  
  1.2.3 Selection of sources and literature 15  
  1.3 Structure 18  

2 Medieval *ius commune* on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money 21  
  2.1 Introduction 21  
  2.2 Medieval *ius commune* on the law of latent defects 23  
  2.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules? 23  
  2.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies 23  
  2.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction 26  
  2.2.1.3 Limitation periods 28  
  2.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies 31  
  2.2.2 Extension to lease 33  
  2.2.3 Increased liability 34  
  2.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables 37  
  2.3 Lesion beyond moiety (*laesio enormis*) 44  
  2.3.1 The remedy for lesion beyond moiety as the preferred remedy for breach of contract 48  
  2.3.2 Lesion beyond moiety - outlook 52  
  2.3.2.1 Presumption of fraud 52  
  2.3.2.2 Limitation periods 55  
  2.3.2.3 Assessment of the just price 55  
  2.3.2.4 Extension to lease and movables 56  
  2.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety 58  
  2.5 Summary and concluding remarks 61  

3 Early modern Castilian law on the remedies for defects in the thing exchanged for money 69  
  3.1 Introduction 69  
  3.2 The legal context of early modern Castile 73  
  3.2.1 Legal sources 73  
  3.2.1.1 Case law from the Royal Chancery of Valladolid 74  
  3.2.2 Scholastic foundations of a natural law theory on remedies for defects in the thing sold 78
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.1 The formulation of general rules</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.2 Fairness in exchange</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.3 A just price</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.4 Deviation from the just price as breach of fairness in exchange</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.5 Fairness in exchange and the sale of a defective thing</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Castilian legal doctrine and practice on the law of latent defects</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.1.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.2 Assessment of price reduction</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.2.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.3 Limitation periods</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.3.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1.4.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Extension to lease</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Increased liability</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis)</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Presumption of fraud</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Limitation periods</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Assessment of the just price</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Extension to buyers, movables, and lease</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.1 Legal practice</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Summary and concluding remarks</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Legal humanism on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Humanist legal doctrine on the law of latent defects</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.2.1 Excurs: a case before the Reichskammergericht</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.3 Limitation periods</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Extension to lease</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Increased liability</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis)</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Presumption of fraud</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Limitation periods</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.3.3 Just price 195  
4.3.4 Extension to buyers, movables, and lease 196  
4.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety 200  
4.5 Summary and concluding remarks 202  

5 Early modern Dutch law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money 210  
5.1 Introduction 210  
5.1.1 Legal practice - sources 211  
5.1.2 Procedural law 213  
5.2 Early modern Dutch legal doctrine and practice on the law of latent defects 217  
5.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules? 217  
5.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies 217  
5.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction 220  
5.2.1.2.1 Legal practice 224  
5.2.1.3 Limitation periods 226  
5.2.1.3.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on limitation 229  
5.2.1.3.2 Roman-Dutch legal practice on limitation 232  
5.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies 234  
5.2.2 Extension to lease 239  
5.2.2.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on extension to lease 242  
5.2.2.2 Legal practice 244  
5.2.3 Increased liability 245  
5.2.3.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on increased liability 247  
5.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables 250  
5.2.4.1 Roman-Dutch legal practice 256  
5.2.4.2 Roman-Frisian legal practice 257  
5.3 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 260  
5.3.1 Presumption of fraud 262  
5.3.2 Limitation periods 264  
5.3.2.1 Legal practice 265  
5.3.3 Assessment of the just price 266  
5.3.3.1 Legal practice 266  
5.3.4 Extension to buyers, movables and lease 267  
5.3.4.1 Legal practice 269  
5.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety 270  
5.5 Summary and concluding remarks 272  

6 Seventeenth and eighteenth century natural law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money 280  
6.1 Introduction 280  
6.1.1 Natural law: a changing paradigm 281  
6.2 Seventeenth and eighteenth century natural law on the law of latent defects 286  
6.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules? 286  
6.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies 286  
6.2.1.2 Natural law theory and positive law: a difficult union 289  
6.2.1.3 Assessment of price reduction 292  
6.2.1.4 Limitation periods 297
TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.2.1.5 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies 301
6.2.2 Extension to lease 305
6.2.3 Increased liability 309
6.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables 313
6.3 The end of laesio enormis? 317
  6.3.1 How to restore a breach of fairness in exchange? 318
  6.3.2 Doctrinal arguments against fairness in exchange 321
6.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety 328
6.5 Summary and concluding remarks 330

7 Codes of civil law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money 338

7.1 Introduction 338
7.2 The Allgemeine Landrecht für die Preußischen Staaten (1794) 342
  7.2.1 The law of latent defects in 18th century Prussia 342
  7.2.2 Towards a Prussian civil code 344
    7.2.2.1 Structure of the Allgemeine Landrecht für die preußischen Staaten 345
    7.2.2.2 Gewährleistung in the Allgemeine Landrecht für die preußischen Staaten 345
  7.2.3 Limitation periods 348
  7.2.4 Lesion beyond moiety (Laesio enormis) 351
    7.2.4.1 Presumption of fraud 353
    7.2.4.2 Limitation periods 355
    7.2.4.3 Just price 356
    7.2.4.4 Extension to lease 357
7.3 The Code civil (1804) 358
  7.3.1 Structure of the Code civil 358
  7.3.2 The Code civil on latent defects 359
    7.3.2.1 La garantie in the Code civil 359
  7.3.3 Limitation periods 360
  7.3.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 362
    7.3.4.1 Presumption of fraud 365
    7.3.4.2 Limitation periods 365
    7.3.4.3 Just price 366
    7.3.4.4 Extension to lease 368
7.4 The Österreichische Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch (1811) 369
  7.4.1 Structure of the Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch 369
  7.4.2 The Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch on latent defects 370
    7.4.2.1 Gewährleistung in the Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch 370
  7.4.3 Limitation periods 372
  7.4.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 373
    7.4.4.1 Presumption of fraud 374
    7.4.4.2 Limitation periods 375
    7.4.4.3 Just price 375
    7.4.4.4 Extension to lease 375
7.5 The Dutch Burgerlijk wetboek 1838 376
  7.5.1 Structure of the Burgerlijk wetboek 1838 377
7.5.2 The Burgerlijk wetboek 1838 on latent defects 378
  7.5.2.1 Vrijwaring of latent defects in the Burgerlijk wetboek 1838 378
7.5.3 Limitation periods 378
7.5.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 379
7.6 The Código civil Español (1889) 382
  7.6.1 Structure of the Código civil 382
  7.6.2 The Código civil on latent defects 383
    7.6.2.1 Saneamiento in the Código civil 383
  7.6.3 Limitation periods 384
  7.6.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 385
7.7 The Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch (1900) 388
  7.7.1 Structure of the Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch 389
  7.7.2 The Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch on latent defects 390
    7.7.2.1 Gewährleistung in the Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch 390
  7.7.3 Limitation periods 391
  7.7.4 Lesion beyond moiety (laesio enormis) 392
7.8 Summary and concluding remarks 396

8 Contemporary civil law 403
  8.1 Introduction 403
  8.2 The new Dutch Burgerlijk wetboek (NBW) 405
    8.2.1 Limitation 408
  8.3 The German Schuldrechtsmodernisierung of 2002 412
    8.3.1 Limitation 413
  8.4 The French Réforme de la prescription of 2008 418
    8.4.1 Limitation 419
  8.5 The Spanish Propuesta para la modernización del Derecho de obligaciones y contratos of 2009 422
    8.5.1 Limitation 424
  8.6 The Austrian Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch of 1811 429
    8.6.1 The ABGB in comparison 432
  8.7 The Proposal for a Common European Sales Law of 2011 434
  8.8 Summary and concluding remarks 437

9 Summary and concluding remarks 442
  9.1 For the last time: B's remedies 442
  9.2 Summary 445
    9.2.1 Research topics 446
    9.2.2 Findings 447
  9.3 Concluding remarks 460

Appendix A. Overview of pleitos and ejecutorias brought before the Royal Chancery of Valladolid 467
Appendix B. Scans of manuscript files of pleitos brought before the Royal Chancery of Valladolid 471

Bibliography 516
Index of cases 538
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Index of sources 543