### Introduction

1. Background and overview of the Merger Directive ........................................... 11
2. Main question and sub-questions ................................................................. 15
3. Justification of topic and research ............................................................... 15
4. Approach ........................................................................................................ 17
5. Relationship between primary EU law, secondary EU law ................................ 20
6. Delimitations ................................................................................................ 21

### Chapter 1 The scope ratione personae

1. Introduction .................................................................................................... 22
2. ‘Company’ ...................................................................................................... 22
   2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 22
   2.2 Literal interpretation .................................................................................. 23
   2.3 Schematic interpretation ........................................................................... 24
      2.3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 24
      2.3.2 Other EU directives ............................................................................ 24
      2.3.3 Article 54 of the TFEU ..................................................................... 26
   2.4 Teleological interpretation ......................................................................... 28
   2.5 Recommendation ....................................................................................... 28
      2.5.1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 28
      2.5.2 Option 1: use the definition of the term ‘company’ in Article 3(1)(b) of the OECD Model Convention ................................................................. 29
      2.5.3 Option 2: replace the term ‘company’ by the term ‘entity’ ..................... 30
   3. ‘Listed form requirement’ ............................................................................. 31
      3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 31
      3.2 The consequence of being listed in Annex I, Part A ................................ 31
      3.3 Annex I, Part A: limitative or exemplary interpretation? ......................... 32
      3.4 Validity of the ‘listed form requirement’ ................................................... 34
         3.4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 34
         3.4.2 Objective of the Merger Directive ....................................................... 35
         3.4.3 Freedom of establishment .................................................................. 36
         3.4.4 Freedom of capital movement ............................................................ 39
            3.4.4.1 Access to the freedom of capital movement ................................ 39
            3.4.4.2 Capital movement ....................................................................... 40
            3.4.4.3 Concurrence with the freedom of establishment ......................... 40
            3.4.4.4 Restriction .................................................................................. 41
            3.4.4.5 Company level vs. shareholder level ......................................... 42
            3.4.4.6 Justification ................................................................................. 44
         3.4.5 Article 18 of the TFEU ..................................................................... 45
         3.4.6 The unwritten EU law principle of equality ....................................... 45
         3.4.7 Treaty non-discrimination provisions ............................................... 48
            3.4.7.1 Introduction ............................................................................... 49
            3.4.7.2 Article 24(1) of the OECD Model Convention ....................... 49


2.3 The ‘permanent establishment requirement’ and the ‘taxable income requirement’

2.3.1 Pivotal roles

2.3.2 Literal interpretation

2.3.3 Historical interpretation

2.3.4 Schematic interpretation

2.3.4.1 Introduction

2.3.4.2 Interplay with the ‘taxable income requirement’

2.3.4.3 Interplay with the ‘branch of activity requirement’

2.3.4.4 Interplay with the term ‘permanent establishment’ in the other direct tax directives

2.3.4.5 Interplay with the terms ‘agencies’ and ‘branches’ in Article 49 of the TFEU

2.3.5 Telelogical interpretation

2.3.6 Deliberation

2.4 Reconsidering the ‘permanent establishment requirement’

2.4.1 Introduction

2.4.2 The immediate taxation of hidden reserves in the light of the freedom of establishment

2.4.3 Unsatisfactory elements in the National Grid regime

2.4.4 Comparison between the regime in the Merger Directive and the National Grid regime

2.4.5 Options for exit tax regimes in the Merger Directive

2.4.6 An improved exit tax regime à la National Grid

2.4.7 The ‘restrictive’ definition or allocation of taxing rights

2.4.8 Allocation of assets and liabilities to the permanent establishment and the subsequent attribution of profits

2.5 The perspective of the Member State of the receiving company

2.6 The transfer of a permanent establishment

2.6.1 Introduction

2.6.2 Reinstatement of losses

2.6.3 Free choice of legal form

3 Carry-over of balance-sheet values at shareholder level

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Description of Article 8 of the Merger Directive

3.5 The perspective of the Member State of the shareholding

3.6 The perspective of the Member State of the shareholding

3.6.1 Introduction

3.6.2 Example 1: Cross-border merger

3.6.3 Example 2: Exchange of shares

3.6.4 Analysis

3.7 Change of the regime applicable to the shareholding

3.7.1 Introduction

3.7.2 Articles 8(6) and 14(2) of the Merger Directive

3.7.3 Interaction with the Parent-Subsidiary Directive

3.7.4 Apportionment of the capital gain
3.7.5 Tax treaty override

3.8 A ‘taxable income requirement’ and exit tax regime in Article 8 of the Merger Directive

4 Carry-over of provisions or reserves

4.1 Introduction

4.2 The term ‘provisions or reserves’

4.3 “Not derived from permanent establishments abroad”

5 Takeover of losses

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Purpose of Article 6 of the Merger Directive

5.3 Article 6 of the Merger Directive does not cover the carry-over of other deferred tax assets than ‘losses’

5.4 Article 6 of the Merger Directive only addresses the losses of the transferring company

5.5 Article 6 of the Merger Directive provides for losses to be carried forward, but not carried back

5.6 Article 6 of the Merger Directive only requires a takeover of losses if this would be allowed with a domestic restructuring operation

5.7 Article 6 of the Merger Directive does not clarify whether (or how) the losses of the transferring company should be apportioned to the transferred assets and liabilities

5.8 Article 6 of the Merger Directive does not specify against which profits the losses of the transferring company can be set off

5.9 Article 6 of the Merger Directive covers the domestic, but not the cross-border takeover of losses

5.9.2 The A Oy decision

5.9.2.1 Facts and preliminary questions

5.9.2.2 Restriction and justification

5.9.2.3 Is the Finnish measure proportional?

5.9.3 When are losses ‘final’?

5.9.3.1 Introduction

5.9.3.2 Distinguishing Marks & Spencer situations from A Oy situations

5.9.3.3 Which amount of losses of the transferring company can be taken into account in the Member State of the receiving company?

5.9.3.4 Conclusion

5.10 Primary EU law does not compel expansion of Article 6 of the Merger Directive

5.11 Expansion of Article 6 of the Merger Directive is preferable

5.12 Proposal to expand and improve Article 6 of the Merger Directive

6 Hybrid entities

6.1 Introduction

6.4 Company level

6.4.1 The transferring company is a hybrid entity

6.4.2 The transferring company is a reverse hybrid entity

6.4.3 The receiving company is a hybrid entity

6.4.4 The receiving company is a reverse hybrid entity
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Shareholder level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1</td>
<td>The shareholder is a hybrid entity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2</td>
<td>The shareholder is a reverse hybrid entity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>The ‘opting-out regime’ of Article 11 of the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1</td>
<td>The transferring or acquired company is a hybrid entity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2</td>
<td>The receiving or acquiring company is a hybrid entity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Reflections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>‘Valuation rules’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>The valuation of the securities received in the case of a transfer of assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>The valuation of the assets and liabilities received in the Member State of the receiving company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Valuation of the securities received by the acquiring company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Conclusion and recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>The combat of tax avoidance under the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The combat of tax avoidance under Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Brief description of the provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>“Principal objective or as one of its principal objectives”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>“Valid commercial reasons”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>“Refuse to apply or withdraw the benefit of”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Framework for the interpretation of Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The context of the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>The purpose of the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The fundamental freedoms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The principle of proportionality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>The principle of legal certainty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Which possible types of tax avoidance can be identified?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>The deferral of taxation by converting, under the Merger Directive’s carry-over facilities, an immediately taxable gain to a gain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The loss of taxing rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The compensation of losses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>The obtainment of a tax benefit after the restructuring operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>The avoidance of taxes not covered by the Merger Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>(How) should the Merger Directive be amended?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 5  The avoidance of double taxation under the Merger Directive  

1 Introduction  
2 The 3D I Srl decision  
3 Conflicts of interpretation concerning the term ‘permanent establishment’  

3.1 Background  
3.2 The result: double taxation and double non-taxation  
3.2.1 Example  
3.2.2 Scenario 1: PE according to Member State A, no PE according to Member State B  
3.2.3 Scenario 2: No PE according to Member State A, PE according to Member State B  
3.3 Distinguishing conflicts of interpretation concerning the term ‘permanent establishment’ from other conflicts of interpretation  
3.3.1 Introduction  
3.3.2 Conflict of interpretation concerning the term ‘securities representing the capital’  
3.3.3 The solution of conflicts of interpretation concerning the term ‘permanent establishment’  
3.3.3.1 Introduction  
3.3.3.2 The meaning of the term ‘permanent establishment’ in Article 5 of the OECD Model Convention  
3.3.3.3 Interpretation by the ECJ and the risk of diverging interpretations  
3.3.3.4 Interpretation by the ECJ and bilateral situations in which no conflict of interpretation exists  
3.3.3.5 Interpretation by the ECJ and the allocation of taxing powers by the Member States  
3.4 Solution for conflicts of interpretation concerning the term ‘permanent establishment’  
3.4.1 Solution: the Member State of the receiving company follows the interpretation by the Member State of the transferring company  
3.4.2 Old roots of the solution  
3.4.3 The solution and the principle of good faith in international law  
3.4.4 The duty of consistent interpretation in EU law  
3.4.5 Counter-arguments against the proposed solution  
4 Specification of the exemption method  
4.1 Different methods of avoiding juridical double taxation  
4.2 The 1969 Proposal obliged Member States to apply either the exemption method or the credit method  
4.3 Arguments in favour of the specification of the exemption method  
4.4 Obstacles with the specification of the exemption method  
5 The Merger Directive and ‘triangular cases’  
5.1 Introduction  
5.2 The taxation of dividends, interests, and royalties attributable to the permanent establishment
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>The taxation of dividends that relate to profits realised with the</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>activities of the (former) transferring company</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Solutions</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 6  Proposal for the amendment of the Merger Directive  317

Chapter 7  Overall conclusion  326

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Summary of conclusions</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main shortcomings and possible solutions</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References  356