

VRIJE UNIVERSITEIT

**Niels Bohr's Complementarity:**

Its Structure, History, and Intersections with Hermeneutics and Deconstruction

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad Doctor aan  
de Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam,  
op gezag van de rector magnificus  
prof.dr. T. Sminia,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen  
ten overstaan van de promotiecommissie  
van de faculteit der Wijsbegeerte  
op vrijdag 16 september 2005 om 10.45 uur  
in de forumzaal van de universiteit,  
De Boelelaan 1105

door

Makoto Katsumori

geboren te Kyoto, Japan

promotor: prof.dr. J.A. Radder  
copromotor: dr. A.C.M. Roothaan

## Preface

This doctoral dissertation is a product of my almost ten years of inquiry into Niels Bohr's idea of complementarity, combined with my equally sustained study of contemporary philosophical thought, specifically hermeneutic philosophy and Derridean deconstruction. The thesis is to some extent based on a couple of my earlier writings, although I have revised part of my previous terminology and argumentation. The first two sections of each of Chapters 2 and 4 have been adapted from my paper "Bohr's Early Complementarity Argument," *Historia Scientiarum*, **8-1** (1998), 1-19. Some of the main points in Chapters 5 and 6 have been provisionally given in my French-language article "L'idée de complémentarité de Bohr en comparaison avec l'herméneutique et la déconstruction," included in Thomas Bedorf und A. B. Blank (eds.), *Diesseits des Subjektprinzips: Körper – Sprache – Praxis, Sophist: Sozialphilosophische Studien*, Vol. 3 (Berlin: Edition Humboldt, 2002), pp. 211-227. Sections 2 to 4 of Chapter 6, together with some of the arguments in Chapter 4, derive from my as yet unpublished article "Complementarity and Deconstruction: Plotnitsky's Analysis and Beyond." Many parts of the thesis also go back to a number of conference presentations I have made in the last several years. Specifically, a paper on Bohr's later idea of complementarity read at the 11<sup>th</sup> International Congress of Logic, Methodology and Philosophy of Science (Cracow, Poland, 1999) formed the basis of the second half of each of Chapters 2 and 4, while a lecture on complementarity and hermeneutics given at the 2003 Conference of the International Society for Hermeneutics and Science (Tihany, Hungary) has grown into Chapter 5 of the present thesis. It is only Chapters 1 and 3 that I have for the most part newly written for this dissertation.

I wish to express my deep gratitude to my supervisor Hans Radder and co-supervisor Angela Roothaan at Vrije Universiteit, the Netherlands, for their generosity in assuming the roles and their attentive and helpful guidance for the

improvement of my thesis. I am also particularly indebted, mainly for the thematic of Chapter 6, to Arkady Plotnitsky's valuable suggestions especially during the period 2001-02, for which time he accepted me as a visiting scholar at Purdue University, USA. I am also grateful to Jan Faye and Tetsuya Takahashi for kindly answering my interpretive questions about Bohr's and Derrida's thought, respectively. My thanks are further due to Michael A. Santone, Jr., Don Nilson, Kiichi Tachibana, Kenji Ito, Patrocínio Schweickart, J. Murray Murdoch, Jr., and R. Jeffrey Ringer, among others, for helpful discussions regarding my previous studies from which this thesis has grown out. I have also been greatly helped by Lawrence R. Pflieger in the proofreading of the thesis. Finally, I wish to thank my mother and my late father for their constant warm encouragement, and Atsuko Sugawara for her daily spiritual support and typing assistance.

## Contents

Preface	iii
Introduction	1
Chapter 1 Bohr and the Development of Quantum Theory: A Brief Review	6
Chapter 2 An Overview of Bohr's Complementarity	21
2.1 The 'Early' Period: Complementarity in Quantum Theory	23
2.2 The 'Early' Period: Complementarity in Various Fields	34
2.3 The Debate with EPR and the 'Middle' Period	44
2.4 Complementarity in the 'Late' Period	55
Chapter 3 Prior Interpretations of Complementarity	65
3.1 Early Interpretations by Physicists	67
3.2 Complementarity and the Realism Debate	75
3.3 Possible Diachronic Changes in Bohr's Thought	83
3.4 Complementarity in the History of Modern Philosophy	91
Chapter 4 A Philosophical-Historical Analysis of Complementarity	100
4.1 The 'Early' Period: Two Conceptions of Complementarity	102
4.2 The 'Early' Period: Further Philosophical Implications	114
4.3 The 'Middle' Period: A Reorganization of Complementarity	126
4.4 The 'Late' Period: Toward an Objectivist Philosophy	137
Chapter 5 Intersections with Hermeneutic Philosophy	146
5.1 Gadamer's Philosophical Hermeneutics	148

5.2	Ricoeur's Hermeneutics of the Text	160
5.3	Complementarity and Hermeneutic Philosophy	169
Chapter 6 Intersections with Derridean Deconstruction		182
6.1	Derrida's Project of Deconstruction	184
6.2	Plotnitsky on Complementarity and Deconstruction	199
6.3	Critical Appraisal of Plotnitsky's Analysis	213
6.4	Complementarity and Derridean Deconstruction	225
Concluding Remarks		236
References		245
Summary in Dutch		259